arXiv:astro-ph/9705055v1 8 May 1997

Comment on "Pulsar Velocities and Neutrino Oscillations"

Yong-Zhong Qian
Physics Department, 161-33, California Institute of Technology, Pasadena, California 91125
(February 5, 2008)

In a recent Letter, Kusenko and Segrè proposed a new mechanism to explain the observed proper motions of pulsars. Their mechanism was based on the asymmetric neutrino emission induced by neutrino oscillations in the protoneutron star magnetic field. In this note I point out that their estimate of the asymmetry in the neutrino emission is incorrect. A proper calculation shows that their mechanism at least requires a magnetic field of strength $B \sim 10^{16}$ G in order to produce the observed average pulsar velocity.

PACS numbers: 97.60.Gb, 14.60.Pq, 97.60.Bw

In a recent Letter [1], Kusenko and Segrè proposed a new mechanism to explain the observed proper motions of pulsars. According to these authors, the average pulsar "kick" velocity may be produced by the anisotropy in the ν_τ emission resulting from the $\nu_e \rightleftharpoons \nu_\tau$ conversions inside the protoneutron star with a magnetic field of strength $B \sim 3 \times 10^{14}$ G. However, these authors incorrectly calculated the asymmetry $\Delta k/k$ in the third component of the neutrino momentum (hereafter, some of their notation is adopted). In deriving $\Delta k/k$, they improperly assumed $dN_e/dT = (\partial N_e/\partial T)_{\mu_e}$. A proper calculation gives a much smaller $\Delta k/k$ than their estimate.

The ν_τ energy flux at the distorted effective τ neutrinosphere (defined by $r = r_0 + \delta \cos\phi$) is $F_{\nu_\tau}(r) \propto T^4$. The temperature and electron number density structure near r_0 can be characterized by the scale heights $h_T = |d\ln T/dr|_{r_0}^{-1}$ and $h_{N_e} = |d\ln N_e/dr|_{r_0}^{-1}$, respectively. The electron number density N_e is proportional to the electron fraction Y_e and the matter density ρ. Numerical supernova calculations [2,3] show that Y_e decreases with increasing radius below the e neutrinosphere. Furthermore, ρ decreases with increasing radius much more steeply than T does inside the protoneutron star [2]. Therefore, we have $h_{N_e} < |d\ln\rho/dr|_{r_0}^{-1} = h_\rho < h_T$. The distortion of the effective τ neutrinosphere can be measured by the dimensionless parameter

$$\alpha \equiv \frac{\delta}{h_{N_e}} = \frac{3}{2}\frac{eB}{\mu_e^2} \approx 0.22 \left(\frac{20\ \text{MeV}}{\mu_e}\right)^2 \left(\frac{B}{10^{16}\ \text{G}}\right).$$

In the region above the effective τ neutrinosphere but below the e neutrinosphere, the conditions $Y_e \approx 0.1$ and $\rho \approx 10^{12}$ g cm^{-3} give $\mu_e \approx 24$ MeV. So we have $\delta \ll h_{N_e}$ for $B \lesssim 10^{16}$ G. To the leading order in α, the asymmetry in the third component of the neutrino momentum is

$$\frac{\Delta k}{k} \approx \frac{1}{6}\frac{\int_0^\pi F_{\nu_\tau}\cos\phi\sin\phi d\phi}{\int_0^\pi F_{\nu_\tau}\sin\phi d\phi} \approx \frac{2}{9}\alpha\frac{h_{N_e}}{h_T}.$$

The next order contribution to $\Delta k/k$ depends on α^3.

A $\Delta k/k$ of a few percent is required to explain the observed average pulsar kick velocity. For $h_{N_e} < h_\rho = h_T/3$ corresponding to $\rho \propto T^3$ [2], the mechanism proposed in Ref. [1] at least requires a magnetic field of strength $B \sim 10^{16}$ G in order to produce $\Delta k/k \sim 0.01$.

I thank George Fuller, Dong Lai, and Petr Vogel for helpful discussions. This work was supported by a grant at Caltech.

---

[1] A. Kusenko and G. Segrè, Phys. Rev. Lett. **77**, 4872 (1996).
[2] A. Burrows and T. J. Mazurek, Astrophys. J. **259**, 330 (1982).
[3] A. Burrows and J. M. Lattimer, Astrophys. J. **307**, 178 (1986).